



# BEAD SUBGRANTEE APPLICATION: SCORING CRITERIA

September 2024

# INTRODUCTION



## Chad Bolling

- Broadband Manager, Wyoming Business Council

## Joanne Hovis

- President, CTC Technology & Energy

# AGENDA

## 1. Scoring (IPv2, 2.4.2 - Scoring Methodology)



# SCORING CRITERIA OVERVIEW



## **Priority Projects**

- a. Primary criteria*
- b. Secondary criteria*

## **Non-Priority Projects**

- a. Primary criteria*
- b. Secondary criteria*

# **PRIORITY PROJECTS**

# PRIORITY PROJECTS SCORING RUBRIC



Primary Criteria (must be ≥ 75%)	Maximum Points Possible
Minimal BEAD program outlay	50
Affordability	15
Fair labor practices	10
Secondary Criteria	
Speed to deployment	9
Additional Prioritization Factors	
Unserved BSLs	9
Natural hazard risk mitigation	3
Local and tribal government coordination	4
<i>Total Score</i>	<i>100</i>

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Minimal BEAD program outlay per project (50 points maximum)

- WBO will calculate a benchmark BEAD allocation for a subgrantee applicant's project area based on WBO's stated goal to serve all unserved and underserved locations.
- "Benchmarks will be calculated using data from CostQuest Associates (the vendor used by the FCC in their Broadband Funding Map) as a starting point; the NTIA has provided this data to states for BEAD planning purposes." WBO will set the total sum of the benchmarks for each CBG in the state equal to the total funding available.

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Minimal BEAD program outlay per project, cont.

- “WBO reserves the right to make additional adjustments as needed to reflect its assessment on how best to achieve WBO and NTIA goals within Wyoming’s BEAD budget allocation.”
- “Applicants will receive points by taking the requested BEAD subsidy as a percentage of the benchmark, converting the percentage to a decimal, multiplying it by 25, and subtracting it from the total potential points.”

Example: If a subgrantee applicant’s cost is 40% of the benchmark, the subgrantee applicant will receive 40 points, calculated using the following formula:  $50 - (0.4 * 25) = 40$  points received.



# PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## **Affordability (15 points maximum)**

- “All applicants must submit the price for a 1 Gbps download/1 Gbps upload plan that will be offered to all BSLs within the service area after deployment is completed.” To compare proposals, WBO will utilize a range of prices (from lowest price submitted to highest price submitted). The range will be divided into 6 quantiles. Proposals will be scored and placed into their respective quantiles and will be awarded points as follows:
  - First quantile (lowest price range) = 15 points
  - Second quantile = 12 points
  - Third quantile = 9 points
  - Fourth quantile = 6 points
  - Fifth quantile = 3 points
  - Sixth quantile (highest price range) = 0 points

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Affordability, cont.

- Example: If 12 total applications are received with respective prices of \$60, \$60, \$70, \$75, \$80, \$80, \$90, \$100, \$120, \$150, \$190, and \$200 and a subgrantee applicant's price is \$60, that subgrantee applicant will receive 15 points.
  - *The subgrantee applicant in the above example who submitted \$150 will receive 3 points.*

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Fair labor practices (10 points maximum)

- “Applicants will be scored based on compliance with federal labor laws and submission of required documents to fulfill NTIA requirements for a maximum of 4 points.”
  - “Applicants who have had no violations of federal labor laws (including the Occupational Safety and Health Act and the Fair Labor Practices Act) will receive 4 points.”
  - “Applicants who have had violations of federal labor laws (including the Occupational Safety and Health Act and the Fair Labor Practices Act) will be compared to other [subgrantee] applicants: [subgrantee] applicants whose total violation count total falls within the highest quartile, will receive no points; those in the second quartile will receive 1 point; those in the third will receive 2 points; and those in the lowest will receive 3 points.”

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Fair labor practices, cont.

- “Applicants will be able to receive an additional 6 points by making a forward-looking commitment to adhere to all state and federal fair labor laws.”
- “Applicants who are new entrants and therefore do not have a record of past compliance with labor laws will be able to earn the maximum 10 points by making a forward-looking commitment to adhere to all state and federal fair labor laws.”

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## **Speed to deployment (9 points maximum)**

- “All applicants are required to begin service no more than 48 months after receiving their grant. All applicants will receive 1 base point for committing to deploy service in their project areas in less than 48 months; applicants will receive additional bonus points for committing to deploy service in their project area even further ahead of the 48-month deadline.”

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Speed to deployment, cont.

- 2 points will be awarded for every six-month increment faster than the 48-month deadline as follows:
  - 24 months or less = 9 points
  - 30 months = 7 points
  - 36 months = 5 points
  - 42 months = 3 points
  - < 48 months = 1 point

Example: If a subgrantee applicant commits to deploying service in 36 months, they will receive 5 points. If a subgrantee applicant commits to deploying service within 12 months, they will receive 9 points.

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Unserved BSLs (9 points maximum)

- “WBO will calculate the ratio of unserved BSLs to served BSLs in an applicant’s project area. All project areas submitted by applicants will then be ranked based on the ratio of unserved BSLs to served BSLs in their project areas.”
- Example: If a subgrantee applicant’s project area falls in the bottom quantile, they will receive 1 point. If a subgrantee applicant’s project area falls in the top quantile, they will receive 9 points.

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## **Natural hazard risk mitigation (3 points maximum)**

- “All applicants will be asked to submit a narrative detailing how they mitigate natural hazard risk in building and operating broadband infrastructure. Applicants whose project area does not include a CBG identified as high-risk (see Section 2.11) will be evaluated on a pass/fail basis on the quality of their approach, with applicants who pass receiving 3 points.”
- “Applicants whose project area includes a high-risk CBG will be asked to submit an additional narrative addressing the NTIA’s six dimensions of natural hazard risk mitigation based on the natural hazards most common in their project area.”



# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Natural hazard risk mitigation, cont.

- “NTIA’s six dimensions include: technology platform (e.g., buried vs. aerial fiber), retrofitting/hardening (e.g., hardened conduits), redundant power (e.g., backup generators at core infrastructure sites), existing risk mitigation plans (already mandated for all applicants), restoration speed (e.g., public commitments around service restoration after an outage), and network redundancies (e.g., connecting new deployment to existing infrastructure to allow for continued service). Applicants will be evaluated on a pass/fail basis based on the quality of their approach, with applicants receiving 0.5 points for their response to each of the six dimensions.”

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Natural hazard risk mitigation, cont.

- Example: If a subgrantee applicant has developed a risk mitigation plan and their project area does not contain any high-risk CBGs, they will receive 3 points. If a subgrantee applicant's project area does include at least one high-risk CBG and the plan has compelling technology platform, risk mitigation, and restoration speed plans, they will receive 1.5 points.

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## **Local and tribal government coordination (4 points maximum)**

- “Wyoming has 99 incorporated cities and towns and one tribal jurisdiction. WBO will calculate how many cities, towns, and/or tribal jurisdictions are located wholly within or overlap with the applicant’s proposed project area. Applicants will receive 1 point for garnering a letter of support from the municipal/tribal government from the jurisdiction that contains the most BSLs within their proposed project area. They will receive 1 point (up to three total additional points) for every 25% of other municipal/tribal governments within their project area who provide a letter of support.”

# PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Local and tribal government coordination, cont.

- Example: If a subgrantee applicant receives a letter of support from the municipal/tribal government that contains the most BSLs in their proposed project area along with letters of support from 50% of the remainder of municipalities in their proposed project area, they will receive 3 points.

# **NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS**

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS

## SCORING RUBRIC



Primary Criteria (must be ≥ 75%)	Maximum Points Possible
Minimal BEAD program outlay	50
Affordability	15
Fair labor practices	10
Secondary Criteria	
Speed to deployment	7
Speed of network and other technical capabilities	6
Additional Prioritization Factors	
Unserved BSLs	6
Natural hazard risk mitigation	3
Local and tribal government coordination	3
<i>Total Score</i>	<i>100</i>

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Minimal BEAD program outlay per project (50 points maximum)

- “WBO will calculate a benchmark BEAD allocation for an applicant’s project area based on WBO’s stated goal to serve all unserved and underserved locations.”
- “Benchmarks will be calculated using data from CostQuest Associates (the vendor used by the FCC in their Broadband Funding Map) as a starting point; the NTIA has provided this data to states for BEAD planning purposes.” WBO will set the total sum of the benchmarks for each CBG in the state equal to the total funding available.

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Minimal BEAD program outlay per project, cont.

- “WBO reserves the right to make additional adjustments as needed to reflect its assessment on how best to achieve WBO and NTIA goals within Wyoming’s BEAD budget allocation. Applicants will receive points by taking the requested BEAD subsidy as a percentage of the benchmark, converting the percentage to a decimal, multiplying it by 25, and subtracting it from the total potential points.”

Example: If a subgrantee applicant’s cost is 40% of the benchmark, the subgrantee applicant will receive 40 points, calculated using the following formula:  $50 - (0.4 * 25) = 40$  points received.



# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Affordability (15 points maximum)

- “All applicants must submit the price for a 100 mbps download/20 mbps upload plan that will be offered to all BSLs within the service area after deployment is completed.” To compare proposals, WBO will utilize a range of prices (from lowest price submitted to highest price submitted). The range will be divided into 6 quantiles. Proposals will be scored and placed into their respective quantiles and will be awarded points as follows:
  - First quantile (lowest price range) = 15 points
  - Second quantile = 12 points
  - Third quantile = 9 points
  - Fourth quantile = 6 points
  - Fifth quantile = 3 points
  - Sixth quantile (highest price range) = 0 points

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Affordability, cont.

- Example: If 12 total applications are received with respective prices of \$60, \$60, \$70, \$75, \$80, \$80, \$90, \$100, \$120, \$150, \$190, and \$200 and a subgrantee applicant's price is \$60, that subgrantee applicant will receive 15 points.
  - *The subgrantee applicant in the above example who submitted \$150 will receive 3 points.*

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Fair labor practices (10 points maximum)

- “Applicants will be scored based on compliance with federal labor laws and submission of required documents to fulfill NTIA requirements for a maximum of 4 points.”
  - “Applicants who have had no violations of federal labor laws (including the Occupational Safety and Health Act and the Fair Labor Practices Act) will receive 4 points.”
  - “Applicants who have had violations of federal labor laws (including the Occupational Safety and Health Act and the Fair Labor Practices Act) will be compared to other applicants: applicants whose total violation count total falls within the highest quartile, will receive no points; those in the second quartile will receive 1 point; those in the third will receive 2 points; and those in the lowest will receive 3 points.”

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – PRIMARY CRITERIA



## Fair labor practices, cont.

- “Applicants will be able to receive an additional 6 points by making a forward-looking commitment to adhere to all state and federal fair labor laws.”
- “Applicants who are new entrants and therefore do not have a record of past compliance with labor laws will be able to earn the maximum 10 points by making a forward-looking commitment to adhere to all state and federal fair labor laws.”

Example: If a subgrantee applicant has had violations of federal labor laws and falls within the second quartile of total violation count, they will receive 1 point.

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Speed to deployment (7 points maximum)

- “All applicants are required to begin service no more than 48 months after NTIA provides approval of WBO’s final proposal. All applicants will receive 1 base point for committing to deploy service in their project area in less than 48 months; applicants will receive additional bonus points for deploying service in their project area even further ahead of the 48-month deadline, with 2 points awarded for every six-month increment faster than the 48-month” deadline as follows:
  - 30 months or less = 7 points
  - 36 months = 5 points
  - 42 months = 3 points
  - < 48 months = 1 point

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Speed to deployment, cont.

- Example: If a subgrantee applicant commits to deploying service in 36 months, they will receive 5 points. If a subgrantee applicant commits to deploying service within 12 months, they will receive 7 points.

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## **Speed of network and other technical capabilities (6 points maximum)**

- “[Subgrantee] applicants will have their technology type, network design and accompanying narrative (see Section 2.4.13.2) evaluated by a broadband industry expert, as determined by WBO, who will evaluate the appropriateness of the [subgrantee] applicant’s proposal for the project area based on geographic, topographic, technical and other elements.”
- “If a [subgrantee] applicant’s technology type and network design is deemed as weak by the broadband industry expert, they will receive 1 point. If a [subgrantee] applicant’s technology type and network design is deemed exceptional by the broadband industry expert, they will receive 6 points.”

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Speed of network and other technical capabilities, cont.

- Example: If a subgrantee applicant's certified speed and latency requirements are scalable to:
  - Less than 500/20 Mbps, they will receive 0 points.
  - 500/20 Mbps, they will receive 2 points.
  - 1 Gbps/35 Mbps, they will receive 5 points.
- In all cases, latency requirements must meet NTIA requirements.
- Example: If the demonstrated useful life for major components:
  - Exceeds ten years, they will receive 1 point.
  - Does not exceed ten years, they will receive 0 points.



# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Unserved BSLs (6 points maximum)

- “WBO will calculate the ratio of unserved BSLs to served BSLs in an applicant’s project area. All project areas submitted by applicants will then be ranked based on the ratio of unserved BSLs to served BSLs in their project areas.”

Example: If a subgrantee applicant’s project area falls in the bottom sextile, they will receive 1 point. If a subgrantee applicant’s project area falls in the top sextile, they will receive 6 points.

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Natural hazard risk mitigation (3 points maximum)

- “All applicants will be asked to submit a narrative detailing how they mitigate natural hazard risk in building and operating broadband infrastructure. Applicants whose project area does not include a CBG identified as high-risk (see Section 2.11) will be evaluated on a pass/fail basis on the quality of their approach, with applicants who pass receiving 3 points. Applicants whose project area includes a high-risk CBG will be asked to submit an additional narrative addressing the NTIA’s six dimensions of natural hazard risk mitigation based on the natural hazards most common in their project area.”

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Natural hazard risk mitigation, cont.

- “NTIA’s six dimensions include: technology platform (e.g., buried vs. aerial fiber), retrofitting/hardening (e.g., hardened conduits), redundant power (e.g., backup generators at core infrastructure sites), existing risk mitigation plans (already mandated for all applicants), restoration speed (e.g., public commitments around service restoration after an outage), and network redundancies (e.g., connecting new deployment to existing infrastructure to allow for continued service). Applicants will be evaluated on a pass/fail basis based on the quality of their approach, with applicants receiving 0.5 points for their response to each of the six dimensions.”

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Natural hazard risk mitigation, cont.

- Example: If a subgrantee applicant has developed a risk mitigation plan and does not contain any high-risk CBGs in their project area, they will receive 3 points. If a subgrantee applicant's project area does include at least one high-risk CBG and the plan has compelling technology platform, risk mitigation, and restoration speed plans, they will receive 1.5 points.

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Local and tribal government coordination (3 points maximum)

- “Wyoming has 99 incorporated cities and towns and one tribal jurisdiction. WBO will calculate how many cities, towns, and/or tribal jurisdictions are located wholly within or overlap with the applicant’s proposed project area. Applicants will receive 1 point for garnering a letter of support from the municipal/tribal government from the jurisdiction that contains the most BSLs within their proposed project area. They will receive 0.5 points (up to two total additional points) for every 25% of other municipal/tribal governments within their project area who provide a letter of support.”

# NON-PRIORITY PROJECTS – SECONDARY CRITERIA



## Local and tribal government coordination, cont.

- Example: If a subgrantee applicant receives a letter of support from the municipal/tribal government that contains the most BSLs in their proposed project area along with letters of support from 50% of the remainder of municipalities in their proposed project area, they will receive 2 points.

# QUESTIONS



<https://wyomingbusiness.org/broadband/>

[broadbandoffice@wyo.gov](mailto:broadbandoffice@wyo.gov)

# WEBINAR DATES



## **BEAD Grant Application Process**

September 13, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT

## **BEAD Grant Project Plan (Technical Requirements)**

September 19, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT

## **BEAD Grant Project Areas & Selection**

September 23, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT

## **BEAD Application Scoring Criteria**

September 30, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT

## **BEAD Application Financial Capability**

October 7, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT

## **BEAD Application Portal Deep Dive**

October 14, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT

## **BEAD Grant Application Q&A**

November 4, 2024

1:00 – 2:00 PM MT